

## **EXHIBIT 24**

## **EXHIBIT 24**

---

**From:** GRAY, KERWIN L (Legal) [KG4575@att.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, November 02, 2009 4:39 PM  
**To:** Karnick, Jerome  
**Subject:** RE: 3G Coverage Ad

Jerry we disagree on the Bill Curtis ad. So I will just briefly address the two points you made.

1. AT&T's 3G network is nationwide as you have acknowledged. And as he races cross country, Mr. Curtis would have access to that network, and incidentally, when outside the 3G coverage area, he would have access to the high speed 2.5G network where he could perform all the same tasks.
2. The scene depicted is not atypical of the desert southwest where AT&T has 3G service.

One final comment, the commercial is device centric highlighting the convenient size of the netbooks, which work on the fastest 3G network in all the places where the vast majority of our customers use them the most.

Kerwin L. Gray  
404.986.1641

---

**From:** Jerome.Karnick@VerizonWireless.com [mailto:Jerome.Karnick@VerizonWireless.com]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 15, 2009 2:46 PM  
**To:** GRAY, KERWIN L (Legal)  
**Subject:** RE: 3G Coverage Ad

Kerwin,

Our revised advertising is already on air. TV began running on Tuesday, and radio began yesterday. I've attached copies of the as-produced TV storyboards and the as-produced radio script for your convenience.

While I appreciate the revisions that were made to the original Bill Curtis ad, the revised version is still misleading. First, Mr. Curtis' statement that he is "racing cross country" with his netbook "with its built-in 3G network" creates the impression that AT&T's 3G network would be available throughout such a trip. Second, while the service station may actually be within AT&T's 3G coverage area, the ad creates the false and misleading impression that AT&T's 3G network is typically available in such locations. Accordingly, I must renew my request that AT&T commit to withdrawing the advertisement. I look forward to your prompt response.

Jerry

---

**From:** GRAY, KERWIN L (Legal) [mailto:KG4575@att.com]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 13, 2009 4:40 PM  
**To:** Karnick, Jerome  
**Subject:** 3G Coverage Ad

Jerry,

11/15/2009

Thank you for your prompt reply to my recent email. It would, however, be helpful if you would elaborate more specifically on Verizon's plan to revise the advertising.

In response to your inquiry I offer the following:

1. In the Bill Curtis ad that you reference, Mr. Curtis (who is a real person and not a character) referred to himself and the places that he goes. And it was clear in context that he was referring to the small size of the device that he was using. Nonetheless, the ad was modified effective August 24th by deleting the challenged phrase. The service station, however, is not in the middle of nowhere. It is deep within the boundaries of AT&T's 3G coverage area.
2. The best selection of smart phones is based on an analysis by Current Analysis of the number of smart phones offered by the carriers. Although the claim would remain accurate regardless of the number offered, the world's best selection is also accurately based solely on the popularity of the smart phones sold only by AT&T.
3. Customer satisfaction with their smart phones is based on a survey by Nielsen.

Kerwin L. Gray  
404.986.1641

The information contained in this message and any attachment may be proprietary, confidential, and privileged or subject to the work product doctrine and thus protected from disclosure. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or an employee or agent responsible for delivering this message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify me immediately by replying to this message and deleting it and all copies and backups thereof. Thank you.

11/15/2009